

National Research University Higher School of Economics

As a manuscript

Ivan Petrov

**«Patterns of transformation of party systems in the European Union
countries
in the 1990s-2010s: modification of the right-left spectrum
influenced by old and new cleavages»**

SUMMARY OF THE DISSERTATION

for the purpose of obtaining academic degree in Political Science

Academic Supervisor
PhD in Political Science
Boris Makarenko

Moscow, 2024

I. general description of work

Relevance of the research topic

Modern democracy is a party democracy. Although in recent decades there have been ongoing discussions about the death of parties, their cartelization, rigidity and lack of representation, there is no doubt that modern democracy is unimaginable without parties. According to prevailing theories, the positions of parties reflect the change in the social status of voters, which makes the party system a mirror of the changes taking place in society.

The development of the countries of the European Union in the last three decades represents an extremely interesting example in this regard, associated with a combination of the unique experience of political life and the clear impact of global trends of post-industrial transformation on the societies of democratic states. In the list of these trends, first of all, it is necessary to include the post-industrial value shift, as well as the impact of the processes of economic globalization, European integration, migration and other crises, radically changing the structure of European societies and the political agenda, the main result of which is the crisis of the social model of post-war European society with its inherent social roles, life expectations and political style.

As a number of modern studies demonstrate, the period marked by the financial crisis of 2008–2013 and the migration crisis of 2015–2016 became a testing time for the party systems of EU countries. The general trend associated with the growing fragmentation of party systems and the entry of new types of parties into politics intensified noticeably after 2008, accompanied not only by the decline of a number of large parties and the boom of populism, but also by obvious changes in the content of debates and legislative activity, and a general reconfiguration of connections between social groups and political programs, parties and their voters.

The current development of party systems in EU countries has thus once again become the focus of research decades later, both in terms of old Western and new post-communist democracies. At the same time, existing theories of change contradict each other, often lacking sufficient evidence based on empirical material covering all European countries over a long period of time. The task of systematically studying the contours of the global transformation of the party spectrum in EU countries, therefore, today serves as a relevant field of research both in theoretical and practical terms.

Problem and research question

The problem of this study lies in the analytical uncertainty of theories describing the process of transformation of European party systems at the turn of the 20th - 21st centuries.

These theories, for the most part, develop the postulates of the classical cleavage theory by Lipset and Rokkan, according to which the stability of party systems is based on the stability of social configurations under the influence of a stepwise process of modernization. In the new conditions of socio-economic and socio-cultural development of European countries, globalization in its many aspects most often claims to be the source of new cleavage, including: the value dimension associated with the departure from traditional structures of social power towards intercultural exchange of standards of a modern secular society ¹; socio-economic dimension associated with the post-industrial refraction of socio-economic relations in the context of division into winners and losers from trade liberalization ²; ethno-territorial dimension associated with growing tension against the background of foreign cultural migration and integration within the EU of countries with different cultural traditions and levels of development ³. The problem of different aspects of

¹ Inglehart RF, Norris P. Trump, Brexit, and the rise of populism: Economic have-nots and cultural backlash. – 2016.

² Oesch D., Rennwald L. Electoral competition in Europe's new tripolar political space: Class voting for the left, center-right and radical right // European journal of political research. – 2018. – Vol . 57. – No. 4. – P. 783-807.

³ Strijbis O., Helmer J., De Wilde P. A cosmopolitan–communitarian cleavage around the world? Evidence from mental polarization and party–voter linkages // Acta Politica. – 2020. – Vol. 55. – No. 3. – P. 408-431.

globalization, presumably affecting the contours of the new cleavage as problematic dimensions of different content, can be supplemented by the fact that a number of researchers argue that the new cleavage has the nature of a composite ⁴(including several independent lines of cleavage) and complex ⁵(affecting mainly personal voter choice rather than positioning of large groups). In the context of the fact that the new cleavage has both structural (globalization) and personal (values) aspects, it can be refracted differently in different EU countries, as noted by a number of researchers emphasizing the subregional originality of electoral choice in different parts of Europe, including , to what extent the new cleavage will act in them as complementary to the socio-economic one, or opposing it, as displacing the old socio-cultural one, or completing it ⁶.

Based on this, the research question of this work is as follows:

How exactly is the new global value cleavage, the essence of which is the non-economic positioning of citizens, formed in the EU countries and directs the process of transformation of party systems in different types of countries?

Degree of scientific development of the problem

In world political science, the topic of parties and party systems has deservedly received the attention of leading researchers over the last century. Among the classics in the study of the theme of parties as such, one can name such figures as Weber, Schumpeter , Duverger , Kirchheimer , Blondel , Sartori , Downs ⁷. We

⁴ Kriesi H. et al. Globalization and the transformation of the national political space: Six European countries compared // *European Journal of Political Research*. – 2006. – Vol. 45. – No. 6. – P. 921-956.

⁵ Hooghe L., Marks G. Cleavage theory meets Europe's crises: Lipset, Rokkan, and the transnational cleavage // *Journal of European public policy*. – 2018. – Vol. 25. – No. 1. – P. 109-135.

⁶ Hutter S., Kriesi H. (ed.). *European party politics in times of crisis*. Cambridge University Press. – 2019.

⁷ Weber M. *Policy How vocation And profession* . / M . Weber – M .: RIPOL classic , 2018. – 288 pp .; Schumpeter Y. A . *Capitalism , socialism And democracy* / Y . A . Schumpeter – M .: Economics , 1995. – 540 p .; Duverger M. *Political parties* / M . Duverger – M .: Academic project . – 2002 – 560 p .; Kirchheimer O. et al. *The transformation of the Western European party systems* // *Political parties and political development*. – 1966. – Vol. 6. – P. 177-200.; Blondel J. *Party systems and patterns of government in Western democracies* // *Canadian Journal of Political Science* / *Revue Canadienne de science politique*. – 1968. – Vol. 1. – No. 2. – P. 180-203. ; Sartori G. *Parties and party systems: A framework for analysis*. ECPR press. – 2005. ; Downs A. *An economic theory of political action in a democracy* // *Journal of political economy*. – 1957. – Vol. 65. – No. 2. – P. 135-150.

owe the classic period of development of the science of parties to the introduction of the concept of the party system and the development of formal indices for measuring its changes over time - first of all, the Laakso-Taagepera Index of the Number of Effective Parties and the Pedersen Party Volatility Index ⁸.

The leading theories that form the basis of the theoretical and methodological approach of our work are the Lipset-Rokkan cleavage theory and the Downs theory of spatial competition ⁹.

the Lipset-Rokkan theory describes cleavages as emerging retrospectively in the context of major social changes and then frozen in the format of stable party systems in Western countries. Discussing the role of the new cleavage, we, following the leading authors of our time, whose views we will consider below, proceed from the correctness of the idea of major shifts as the driving mechanism for the emergence of cleavages, as well as from the direct projection of cleavages onto political life. Meanwhile, it can be questioned that when a cleavage occurs, it immediately translates into the emergence of new leading parties. As Karamani showed ¹⁰, the territorial dimension of party politics is no less important than the structural one, being responsible for the emergence of ethnic, religious, and territorial parties. Moreover, the new cleavage, associated with the emergence of party families of a new type, described by Lipset and Kitschelt ¹¹, has not yet formed a new look for inclusive politics. On the contrary, as Green- Pedersen ¹² emphasizes

⁸ Laakso M., Taagepera R. "Effective" number of parties: a measure with application to West Europe // Comparative political studies. – 1979. – Vol. 12. – No. 1. – P. 3-27. ; Pedersen MN The dynamics of European party systems: changing patterns of electoral volatility // European journal of political research. – 1979. – Vol . 7. – No. 1. – P. 1-26.

⁹ Lipset SM, Rokkan S. Cleavage structures, party systems, and voter alignments: an introduction. Free Press, 1967; Downs A. An economic theory of political action in a democracy // Journal of political economy. – 1957. – Vol. 65. – No. 2. – P. 135-150.

¹⁰ Caramani D. The nationalization of politics: The formation of national electorates and party systems in Western Europe. Cambridge University Press. – 2004.

¹¹ Kitschelt HP Left-libertarian parties: Explaining innovation in competitive party systems // World Politics. – 1988. – Vol . 40. – No. 2. – P. 194-234.; Lipset M. S. Political man: social foundations of politics / M. S. Lipset - M.: Mysl, 2016 – 611 p.

¹² Green-Pedersen C. The Reshaping of West European Party Politics: Agenda-Setting and Party Competition in Comparative Perspective. Comparative Politics. – 2019.

that during the post-industrial transformation large parties of the old type were able to successfully seize a number of significant topics on the post-industrial agenda, maintaining dominance based on their reputational capital.

In modern scholarship, the nature of the new cleavage includes several lines of argument regarding its ability to be institutionalized as part of the transformation of previously stable party systems in EU countries.

In particular, within the framework of the concept of Inglehart, Welzel and Norris¹³, the new post-industrial shift is derived from a global transformation of values, giving rise not to the emergence of new social groups, but to the division of the electorate of old parties along a new line of cleavage. Similarly, Mudde¹⁴ emphasizes the emotional and stylistic component of voting for new parties - together, these two trends ultimately reproduce the increase in votes for populists.

An alternative concept, advocated in the works of Kitschelt and Rehm, Oesch and Rennwald, and Alzheimer and Carter¹⁵, is associated with the explanation of the new cleavage in terms of a new socio-economic division between the winners and losers of globalization, complementing the old division between wage earners and managers that supported the right-left opposition in the post-war party systems of EU countries. In this perspective, the process of transformation of party systems is associated with a restructuring of the positions of party families regarding the change in the social foundations of their support and with the acquisition of a new place by niche parties in the changing structure of program preferences of voters.

¹³ Inglehart R. *Modernization, cultural changes And democracy* / R. Inglehart, K. Welzel – M.: New publishing house, 2011. – 462 pp.; Inglehart RF, Norris P. *Trump, Brexit, and the rise of populism: Economic have-nots and cultural backlash.* – 2016.

¹⁴ Mudde C. *Three decades of populist radical right parties in Western Europe: So what?* // *European Journal of Political Research.* – 2013. – Vol. 52. – No. 1. – P. 1-19.

¹⁵ Kitschelt H., Rehm P. *Party alignments: Change and continuity* // *The politics of advanced capitalism.* – 2015. – P. 179-201.;

Oesch D., Rennwald L. *Electoral competition in Europe's new tripolar political space: Class voting for the left, center-right and radical right* // *European journal of political research.* – 2018. – Vol. 57. – No. 4. – P. 783-807.; Alzheimer K., Carter E. *Political opportunity structures and right-wing extremist party success* // *European Journal of Political Research.* – 2006. – Vol. 45. – No. 3. – P. 419-443.

The concept of Hooghe and Marks ¹⁶combines value and socio-economic aspects, introducing the formula GAL - TAN , which describes a new cleavage through the opposition of green-alternative-liberal and traditionalist-authoritarian-nativist approaches to the articulation of votes from new party families against the backdrop of existential choice in favor of or against globalization.

According to the view of a team of authors led by Kriesi ¹⁷, the new cleavage includes several lines of splits that combine differently in different European countries. These schisms include topics of globalization, values, migration, and European integration. As argued by Bartolini and Meyer and Bornschier ¹⁸, thematic diversity can be associated not only with objective country differences, but also with the presence of a wide subjectivity of parties regarding the interpretation of divisions in their competitive struggle.

In the literature, the theme of country differences in the positioning of parties in European countries has been conceptualized by researchers such as Dalton, Siaroff , Hutter and Kriesi ¹⁹, who drew attention to the external context of the transformation of the party field, be it ideological competition between families, shifts in voting patterns, or the geographical specificity of identifying problems within the European Union. The most important role in determining the role of external, institutional and cultural conditions for the formation of party competition, in our opinion, was played by Lijphart's ²⁰approach to the classification of political

¹⁶ Hooghe L., Marks G. Cleavage theory meets Europe's crises: Lipset, Rokkan, and the transnational cleavage // *Journal of European public policy*. – 2018. – Vol. 25. – No. 1. – P. 109-135.; Marks G. et al. Cleavage theory // *The Palgrave handbook of EU crises*. – 2021. – P. 173-193.

¹⁷ Kriesi H. et al. Globalization and the transformation of the national political space: Six European countries compared // *European Journal of Political Research*. – 2006. – Vol. 45. – No. 6. – P. 921-956.

¹⁸ Bartolini S., Mair P. Identity, competition and electoral availability: the stabilization of European electorates 1885-1985. ECPR Press. – 2007; Bornschier S. Cleavage politics in old and new democracies // *Living reviews in Democracy*. – 2009. – No. 1.

¹⁹ Dalton RJ *Political realignment: Economics, culture, and electoral change*. Oxford University Press. – 2018.; Siaroff A. *Comparative European party systems: An analysis of parliamentary elections since 1945*. Routledge. – 2002.; Hutter S., Kriesi H. (ed.). *European party politics in times of crisis*. Cambridge University Press. – 2019.

²⁰ Lijphart A. et al. *Patterns of democracy: Government forms and performance in thirty-six countries*. Yale university press. – 2012.

systems of modern democracies and the description of the logic of their functioning according to the division into majoritarian and consensus patterns, which became the cornerstone in our own classification of patterns transformation.

Summing up the interim results, we can say that the above-described authors laid the foundations for a theoretical understanding of the new cleavage as, on the one hand, associated with the universal processes of globalization and post-industrial transformation, and, on the other hand, variable in the country dimension, requiring a strictly empirical approach to the study of party shifts in individual EU countries with reference to the systemic reasons for the existing differences.

The question of the practical measurement of the positioning of parties within divisions in this context was raised by such researchers as Budge and Laver, Gabel and Huber, Franzmann and Kaiser, Akhremenko, Korguniuk, Makarenko ²¹. A common point for different approaches that have used methods from deductive logic to factor analysis is the consideration of divisions as structural phenomena that matter in the field of real political competition.

In this context, in our study we also turn to studies that act as heirs to Downs' theory of spatial competition, complicating its model to a level suitable for analyzing the field of multiparty competition with its characteristic sectorality and limited predictability of party behavior.

At the theoretical level, these studies include the works of Cox, Budge, Harmel, Janda, Colman ²², which describe the logic of decision-making within the

²¹ Budge I., Laver M. The political basis of government coalitions: A comparative investigation // *British journal of political science*. – 1993. – Vol. 23. – No. 4. – P. 499-519.; Gabel MJ, Huber JD Putting parties in their place: Inferring party left-right ideological positions from party manifestos data // *American Journal of Political Science*. – 2000. – P. 94-103.; Franzmann S., Kaiser A. Locating political parties in political space: A reanalysis of party manifesto data // *Party politics*. – 2006. – P. 12. – No. 2. – P. 163-188.; Akhremenko, A. S. Electoral space: theoretical and methodological problems: dis. ... dr. watered Sciences: 23.00.01 / Akhremenko Andrey Sergeevich - M., 2009. – 430 pp.; Korguniuk Yu. G. Concept of demarcations and factor analysis / Yu.G. Korguniuk // *Journal of political philosophy and sociology of politics "Polity. Analysis. Chronicle. Forecast"*. – 2013. – No. 3 (70). – P. 31-61.; Makarenko B. I. Dynamics of the political spectrum of European party systems (1990-2021). / B.I. Makarenko, I.I. Petrov - *Polis. Political research*. – 2023. – No. 1. – WITH. 11-28.

²² Cox GW Making votes count: strategic coordination in the world's electoral systems. Cambridge University Press. – 1997; Budge I. A new spatial theory of party competition: Uncertainty, ideology and political equilibria viewed comparatively and temporally // *British journal of political science*. – 1994. – Vol. 24. – No. 4. – P. 443-467.; Harmel R., Janda K. An integrated theory of party goals and party change // *Journal of theoretical politics*. – 1994. –

framework of competitive struggle between parties under conditions of uncertainty. In the works of the new wave, which include the works of a team of researchers led by Adams, Meguid, Hobolt and De Vries, Bale and Abou-Chadi²³, a fundamentally important distinction for us between the strategies of inclusive and niche parties was derived and empirically substantiated, allowing us to model competition between new party families and old large parties. Conceptualization of the role of the party organization in the works of Kitschelt, Katz and Mair, Dalton, Green-Pedersen, Gunther and Diamond²⁴ helps to describe the evolution of the strategy of major parties in European countries associated with the reformatting of their agenda against the backdrop of post-industrial challenges.

In practical terms, the most important in the context of modeling spatial competition are the works of Enelow and Hinich, Granberg and Brown, Rabinowitz and MacDonald, Quinn and Martin, as well as Akhremenko in terms of their adaptation in domestic science²⁵. These models, outside of their mathematical basis, are considered by us as the basis for building the logic of reasoning about the connection between changes in party programs and spatial competition of party

– Vol. 6. – No. 3. – P. 259-287.; Janda K., Colman T. Effects of party organization on performance during the 'golden age' of parties // *Political studies*. – 1998. – Vol. 46. – No. 3. – P. 611-632.

²³ Adams J. et al. Are niche parties fundamentally different from mainstream parties? The causes and the electoral consequences of Western European parties' policy shifts, 1976–1998 // *American Journal of Political Science*. – 2006. – Vol. 50. – No. 3. – P. 513-529.; Meguid BM Competition between unequals: The role of mainstream party strategy in niche party success // *American Political Science Review*. – 2005. – P. 347-359.; De Vries CE, Hobolt SB When dimensions collide: The electoral success of issue entrepreneurs // *European Union Politics*. – 2012. – Vol. 13. – No. 2. – P. 246-268.; Bale T. Cinderella and her ugly sisters: the mainstream and extreme right in Europe's bipolarizing party systems // *West European Politics*. – 2003. – Vol. 26. – No. 3. – P. 67-90.; Abou-Chadi T. Niche party success and mainstream party political shifts – how green and radical right parties differ in their impact // *British Journal of Political Science*. – 2016. – Vol. 46. – No. 2. – P. 417-436.

²⁴ Kitschelt HP Left-libertarian parties: Explaining innovation in competitive party systems // *World Politics*. – 1988. – Vol. 40. – No. 2. – P. 194-234. ; Katz RS, Mair P. The cartel party thesis: A restatement // *Perspectives on politics*. – 2009. – Vol. 7. – No. 4. – P. 753-766.; Dalton RJ Citizen politics: Public opinion and political parties in advanced industrial democracies. Cq Press. – 2018; Green-Pedersen C. The Reshaping of West European Party Politics: Agenda-Setting and Party Competition in Comparative Perspective. *Comparative Politics*. – 2019; Gunther R., Diamond L. Species of political parties: A new typology // *Party politics*. – 2003. – Vol. 9. – No. 2. – P. 167-199.

²⁵ Enelow JM, Hinich MJ The spatial theory of voting: An introduction. CUP Archive. – 1984; Granberg D., Brown T.A. The perception of mental distance // *Western Political Quarterly*. – 1992. – Vol. 45. – No. 3. – P. 727-750.; MacDonald S., Listhaug O., Rabinowitz G. Issue and Party Support in Multiparty Systems. *The American Political Science Review*. – 1991 – Vol. 85. – No. 4. – P. 1107-1131.; Quinn K., Martin A. An Integrated Computational Model of Multiparty Electoral Competition. // *Statistical Science*. – 2002 – Vol . 17. – No. 4. – P. 405-419.; Akhremenko, A. S. Spatial modeling of electoral choice: development, modern problems and prospects (II) / A.S. Akhremenko // *Polis. Political research* . – 2007. – No. 2. – S. 165-179.

families both for the nuclear voter and for the conditionally median voter belonging to different social groups.

The task of a comprehensive description of the transformation of the party systems of the EU countries in modern times, therefore, includes an appeal to two large blocks of literature related to the development of the classical theories of Downs and Lipset-Rokkan and their mutual integration as a more general one, setting the basis for reasoning (the cleavage theory) and a more particular one, interpreting specific changes in parties (the theory of spatial competition).

Among the sources we use, we should mention databases on the positioning of parties in space and the state of party systems in general: Project Manifesto (MARPOR), Chapel Hill Expert Survey (CHES), Who governs Europe , Parties and elections in Europe , PolitPro , ParlGov ²⁶.

Thus, speaking about the research of the problem, it is necessary to emphasize the presence of a rich theoretical heritage, as well as diverse empirical material for studying the topic of party transformation in the EU countries in recent times. Meanwhile, at the same time, there are many contradictions in defining the nature of the new cleavage, just as there are no approaches in terms of conceptual interpretation of the phenomenon of inter-party competition in the countries of modern Europe.

Purpose and objectives of the study

The purpose of the dissertation is to highlight patterns of transformation of party systems in EU countries during the period 1990-2020 in the context of the positioning of parties in the structure of socio-political divisions. To achieve the goal, it is planned to describe key shifts in the party politics of EU countries at the

²⁶ Volkens, A. et al. (Eds.). Mapping policy preferences from texts: statistical solutions for manifesto analysts. OUP Oxford. – 2013. – Vol. 3.; Bakker R. et al. Measuring party positions in Europe: The Chapel Hill expert survey trend file, 1999–2010 // Party Politics. 2015. – Vol. 21. – No. 1. – P. 143-152.; <https://whogoverns.eu/> ; <http://www.parties-and-elections.eu/> ; <https://politpro.eu/en> ; <https://parlgov.org/> .

level of party families, subregions and the sample as a whole, based on their empirical measurement through the introduction of original cleavage indices created on the basis of the Manifesto database Project (MARPOR)²⁷. Thus, the focus of the study is not the flow of votes from one party to another, but general trends in competition between families and ideological platforms.

The stages of achieving the research goal were the following sequence of actions:

1. Developing relevant cleavage indices based on a critical examination of new cleavage theories to measure shifts in the positioning of parties and their families in EU countries between the early 1990s and the early 2020s;

2. Description of the profiles of party families, their electoral results and subregional varieties of positioning in the context of key trends in their transformation, based on original cleavage indices using statistical methods;

3. Analysis of key shifts and trends in the transformation of the structure of spatial competition at the level of both the EU as a whole and individual subregion, according to the mutual positioning of party families in the space of axes of divisions formed by the original indices;

4. Identification of patterns of transformation of party systems in EU countries based on a combination of the findings of this analysis with the results of a case study aimed at identifying significant characteristics of the political systems of 25 sample countries.

Research hypothesis

The hypothesis of the study is that the logic of the transformation of the party systems of the EU countries in the period 1990-2020 reflects the process of

²⁷ Volkens, A. et al. (Eds.). Op. cit.

institutionalization of a new global-value cleavage, reflecting non-economic positioning of the citizens, during which it had an increasingly increasing impact on the structure of party systems, weakening the dominance of the role of socio-economic cleavage and causing an increase in voting for parties of a new type, as well as a noticeable transformation of the profiles of old catch-all parties.

The assumption underlying the study suggests that in different European countries this process took place in the context of its own institutional and subregional specificities.

Methodological basis of the study

The key methodological approach in the study was comparative analysis within the framework of a spatial approach to inter-party competition. This approach is fundamentally associated with the ideas of neo-institutionalism, which views parties as actors acting according to rules dictated by the structural and institutional features of the party-political system. During the comparative analysis, we went through three stages related to the relevant research tasks:

- First, a comparison of the positioning of party families with each other and in different time periods according to the application of the original cleavage indices to a sample of parties;
- Secondly, interpretation of changes in the party spectrum, taking into account the mutual positioning of all party families across the EU and individual subregions according to two key indices reflecting positioning according to the old socio-economic and new global value cleavages;
- Thirdly, conducting a comparative case study of 25 sample countries in order to correlate their institutional characteristics with the trajectories of transformation of the party spectrum in these countries and draw conclusions about the role of these characteristics in identifying individual patterns of transformation of party systems.

During these stages of the study, we relied on the readings of division indices that we derived using original formulas based on the MARPOR party positioning database ²⁸(Manifesto Project). This database, based on content analysis of party programs, contains a set of many variables characterizing the positions of parties, some of which were transformed by us into a series of indices that, according to theoretical literature, reflect the positioning of parties along different cleavages - the old socio-economic, the old socio-cultural and the new global-value, presented as a set of problematic dimensions associated with them. The second database, whose presence provided additional validity of the measurements, was CHES ²⁹(Chapel Hill Expert Survey), whose party positioning indices are based on a survey of experts. The identification of indices methodologically allowed us to further use quantitative methods, analyzing the positioning of parties according to the cleavage indices relative to each other.

At the first stage of the study, in the context of comparing the positioning of party families, we used the following methods: descriptive statistics, correlation analysis, factor analysis, cluster analysis. As part of descriptive statistics, we formed descriptions of the profiles of party families based on the spread of average values for cleavage indices for parties belonging to seven deductively identified party families. The testing of party families for structural unity was carried out through cluster analysis applied to the full sample of parties and proved that these categories have real meaning. Correlation analysis, playing a crucial role, was used in our study to highlight structural connections within party profiles by finding significant correlations in the positioning of parties of individual families by indices. The role of factor analysis in this case was reduced to the analysis of individual party families for the presence of subgroups in them that position themselves differently in relation to key indices.

²⁸Volkens, A. et al. (Eds.). Op. cit.

²⁹ Bakker R. et al. Op. cit.

At the second stage of the study, in the context of analyzing the positioning of party families within a single spectrum, we used, firstly, the conclusions obtained from the use of descriptive statistics, correlation, cluster and factor analysis in order to form a picture of party configurations across the EU and subregions, firstly secondly, paired linear regression to track patterns of flow of votes from one family to another against the background of changing data configurations.

At the third stage of the study, the main method was a case study of the transformation of party systems in 25 sample countries, carried out using a single comparative scheme, including the correlation of information from three sources. The first of these was data obtained through descriptive statistics on the positioning of parties in specific countries within the field formed by the MARPOR and CHES indices, reflecting the old socio-economic and new global value cleavages. The second source was the Who project database *Governs Europe*³⁰, *Parties and Elections in Europe*³¹, *ParlGov*³² and *PolitPro*³³, which provided a range of conventional indices for the sample countries, including the Effective Number of Parties, polarization and volatility measures. The third source of data was the case study itself, which described a number of deductively derived qualitative characteristics of the 25 sample countries, including the type of political system of the country according to Lijphart, type of electoral system, form of government, type of administrative-territorial structure, subregional affiliation, characteristics of national political culture, quality democratic process, level of socio-economic development, state of the welfare state model, the importance of ethno-territorial voting.

Based on a combination of information from three sources, analyzed in the context of the direction of transformation of the party systems of 25 sample countries during the 1990-2020s, we drew conclusions, firstly, about the presence of six

³⁰ <https://whogoverns.eu/>

³¹ <http://www.parties-and-elections.eu/>

³² <https://parlgov.org/>

³³ <https://politpro.eu/en>

significant patterns of transformation of the party systems of the EU countries, and secondly, about the presence of a significant connection between the difference in the trajectories of transformation of the party systems of the EU countries within the framework of dividing countries into patterns and a number of characteristics of these countries, first of all, the type of party-political system according to Lijphart .

Scientific provisions submitted for defense.

1. The party systems of the EU countries in the 1990-2020s experienced a process of fundamental transformation in the context of the institutionalization of a new global value cleavage, which manifested itself in a number of key shifts. Firstly, during the period under review, there was a rise in support for parties of a new type, focusing on a global value cleavage - parties belonging to such families as right-populist, green, left-populist and left-liberal. Secondly, the institutionalization of the new cleavage in EU countries has had the effect of partially shifting the attention of the major parties from economic to non-economic issues such as the environment, migration and nationalism. Thirdly, in the wake of the financial crisis of 2008, in most EU countries, a new key axis of inter-party confrontation began to be built, emerging as an opposition between the cultural-liberal (economically more left-wing) and cultural-conservative (economically more right-wing) poles. At the same time, in the 2010s, the economic positions of parties on average also shifted to the left compared to the neoliberal consensus of the pre-crisis years, with the majority of new party families taking positions close to the center.

2 . The post-industrial transformation of the party spectrum in EU countries has both common features and differences depending on the subregion of Europe.

The universal trend accompanying the institutionalization of new cleavage in the EU countries is the growth of polarization along two axes of divisions at once - the new global value and the old socio-economic one. At the same time, in the center of the polarizing spectrum, there is an interpenetration of the positions of different

party families. At the same time, the process of polarization along the new global value axis covers primarily the economic right flank of the spectrum, where parties show greater flexibility and country variability in terms of changing positions, while economic left parties predominantly maintain unity around progressive guidelines.

At the same time, in the countries of Western and post-communist Europe, the principles of building a new party spectrum have fundamental differences. Thus, in Western European countries, a high degree of structuring of the party spectrum along cleavages contributes to the rise of niche parties focused on a global value agenda, and creates a crisis for those catch-all parties whose positioning looks suboptimal in the new realities. We are talking, first of all, about the Social Democrats, whose electorate is being split by the process of new polarization. On the contrary, in post-communist countries, where the contours of inter-party competition reflect the logic of the consistent institutionalization of various problem fields during transition, the rise of new party families is not observed, and a new global value agenda is built into the positioning of old parties more as a set of problems than as a single cleavage.

3. The fundamental difference between volatile post-communist and structured Western European party systems provides the basis for identifying patterns. Post-communist countries generally follow a single direction of transformation associated with the restructuring of party systems as new problematic divisions enter politics. The distinct pattern of dominant parties, characterizing Hungary and Poland in the 2010s, describes a special case of successful positioning of a major party in a post-communist volatile environment, but not a structural division between countries. On the contrary, in the case of Western and Southern European countries, belonging to different transformation patterns is based on the identification of both structural and institutional differences that influence the design of inter-party competition.

4. The most important factor determining the nature of the transformation of party systems in the countries of Western and Southern Europe is the type of party-

political system according to Lijphart³⁴. Depending on whether a country gravitates towards a majoritarian-polarized or a consensus-coalition type of party-political system, the process of institutionalization of global value demarcation in it will have different consequences for the leading parties. Thus, in coalition systems, the dominant trend is fragmentation of the old party system towards a more complex sectoral division of the electorate. On the contrary, in polarized systems, the institutionalization of a new cleavage initiates the dysfunction of the old type of polarization, which is accompanied by the risk of replacing large all-inclusive parties with new, including populist alternatives, especially in the presence of a crisis in the socio-economic development model.

Work structure

The structure of the dissertation research consists of a table of contents, an introduction, three chapters, a conclusion, a list of references and six appendices.

Contribution to the research field

The transformation of party systems in EU countries is a large-scale process that is currently taking place and is highly significant for explaining and predicting the dynamics of European politics. Identification of patterns of transformation of party systems in EU countries contributes to a better understanding of the patterns of party interaction in conditions of unpredictability, shedding light on the logic of spatial competition in developed countries. In terms of the significance of the research findings, it is worth saying that within its framework, the contribution of structural and institutional factors to the formation of different patterns of transformation of party systems, occurring under the influence of the process of institutionalization of a new global-value cleavage, can be traced.

In theoretical terms, the latter contributes to the implementation of the descriptive and predictive functions of political science in the context of expanding

³⁴ Lijphart A. et al. Patterns of democracy: Government forms and performance in thirty-six countries. Yale university press. – 2012.

the understanding of which external factors are most significant in the process of transformation of party systems, determining its contours and direction in the presence of several probable development scenarios. First of all, we are talking about the significance of the party system's tendency to operate within the framework of a consensus or majoritarian political system according to Lijphart's classification. In addition, in theoretical terms, the contribution of this study is to confirm, on a large sample, the thesis about the universal nature of the institutionalization of the new demarcation in the EU countries and the radical impact of this process, firstly, on the likelihood of parties of a new type entering politics, and secondly, on the transformation agendas of the old catch-all parties.

In practical terms, this study systematizes knowledge about the transformation of party systems in EU countries, studying its course both at the level of transformation of the profile and agenda of seven party families, and at the level of subregional differences in the structuring of the party spectrum. Within the framework of the latter, this study partially systematizes and partially confirms the findings in the literature about the structural difference between structured Western European and volatile post-communist party systems in terms of the logic of their development. The direct contribution of the study also lies in describing the current state of spatial competition in the EU countries, including such phenomena as the heterogeneity of the polarization of party families along the new cleavage, the diversity of the formation of a global value agenda for parties of different families, the spatial nature of the crisis in the positioning of the Social Democrats in the 2010s, as well as the presence of an unobvious shift of the party spectrum to the left after the 2008 crisis. The final contribution of the study is the classification of 25 EU countries according to their inherent patterns of transformation of party systems in the period from the early 1990s to the early 2020s.

In the context of domestic science, the contribution of this study also consists in popularizing the use of the MARPOR and CHES databases in comparative

research of party systems and in publishing analytical findings based on access to a sample with a large coverage, both geographically and chronologically.

II . Basic provisions of the work

The introduction substantiates the relevance and scientific novelty of the research, defines its subject and object, describes the purpose and objectives, formulates research hypotheses, and also outlines its theoretical and methodological foundations. The introduction also describes the degree of development of the problem, the empirical basis of the study, the sources of data used, and the sample size. In the final part of the introduction, the significance of the contribution of the study to science and practice is substantiated and the provisions to be defended are formulated, describing the main findings of the study.

The first chapter, “Theoretical and methodological framework for studying the transformation of party systems,” describes the theoretical foundations of the study, including a brief excursion into the theory of parties and party systems, as well as a description of the methodological approach, data sources and sampling, research techniques and ways of classifying parties into subregions and families . Within the framework of the dissertation structure, the first chapter formulates the basics of the approach, within the framework of which the process of transformation of the party systems of the EU countries is further examined.

Paragraph 1.1. “The Dynamics and Structure of Interparty Competition as the Main Driver of the Transformation of Party Systems” provides an overview of classical and modern theories describing the functioning of parties and party systems. Within the framework of this review, the topics of the role and functions of political parties are revealed, their classical and modern typologies are given, the concept of a political system, methods of its characterization and measurement, as well as a historical and genetic cross-section of the development of parties are revealed. The main part of the paragraph contains an analysis of the cleavage theory, both in its classical form and in modern interpretations, as well as the theory of spatial competition that complements together the research design of the study. Within the framework of this analysis, the basic concepts and concepts used within

the framework of these approaches are revealed, and the patterns of adjusting party systems to current divisions and competition of different types of parties in the space of the political spectrum are described. In the context of the presented research, we are talking about the substantiation in this paragraph of the possibility of using these theories for the purpose of analyzing party configurations, spatial shifts and transformation of the political spectrum in different EU countries. In addition, this paragraph introduces the concept of cleavages, and also illustrates the most important component of the research problem, namely the multiplicity and inconsistency of modern interpretations of the nature of the new post-industrial cleavage.

Paragraph 1.2. “Measuring Party Shifts: Methodological Foundations of Analysis” introduces the reader to the specifics of the study's methodological approach, exploring themes of sampling, data, and methods. The second paragraph examines the possibilities for applied research on the positioning of parties in the space of the political spectrum, provides a basic list of methods used in the work, analyzes the features of MARPOR and CHES as data sources, critically examines the existing indices of party positioning and proposes our own with a detailed disclosure of their formulas and content . Also in the second paragraph, the division of the sample in a geographical and chronological manner is discussed, the concept of a party family is introduced, and the methodological basis for conducting case studies in the third chapter of the dissertation is described. In the context of the presented study, the second paragraph summarizes the design of the empirical part.

The second chapter, “Transformation of party family positions and the political spectrum of EU countries,” presents the results of an analysis of party family profiles, their transformation and spatial positioning based on MARPOR and CHES data. The basis for the analysis was the original cleavage indices, reflecting the positioning of parties along them, as well as electoral statistics. Within the structure of the dissertation, the second chapter provides the basis for a study on the direction and transformation of the party systems of the EU countries in 1990-2020.

Paragraph 2.1. *Position Shifts in Individual Party Families* examines the transformation of the profiles of five party families between 1990 and 2020, including: Social Democrats, Radical Left, Greens, Liberals, Christian Democrats and Conservatives. The first paragraph establishes that each of the families described above has a clearly defined profile, the contours of whose transformation clearly indicate both the presence of common tendencies for change among parties, and the characteristics of inter-party competition in specific sectors of the party spectrum. In the context of the presented research, the first paragraph provides direct empirical results of working with indices based on MARPOR and CHES.

Paragraph 2.2. “Cultural Right/Right Populist Parties and the Socio-Cultural Cleavage in Party Agendas” focuses on the party profile of right-wing populist parties in order to answer the question of the family’s place within the spatial competition of parties. This section also raises questions about the presence of structural unity within a sample of right-wing populists from different countries and about the variability in the reaction of other party families to the rise of the cultural right in the 2010s. In the context of the presented research, the second paragraph draws important conclusions that confirm both the assumption of spatial competition as a significant factor in inter-party relations, and the hypothesis of sub-regional differences in the positioning of party families in EU countries.

In the third chapter, “Main trends in the transformation of party systems in EU countries and their classification by patterns,” the final provisions of the study are formed related to the description of the general trends in the transformation of the party spectrum in EU countries, the identification of patterns of transformation of party systems in EU countries and the description of differences in the transformation of party systems in EU countries at the country level.

Paragraph 3.1. “General contours of the transformation of party systems in EU countries” is key to the presented study, containing conclusions regarding the general trends and patterns of transformation of the configuration of parties within the party spectrum for EU countries in the period from 1990 to 2020. In addition,

this paragraph clearly states the presence significant difference in the formation of the party spectrum and inter-party competition in the countries of North-Western and Central-Eastern Europe against the background of the relative unity of the countries of North-West and Southern Europe. Also, the first paragraph provides data from a regression analysis of electoral statistics, which provides the basis for a number of conclusions about the direction of the flow of votes during the period of accelerated volatility that followed the 2008 crisis.

According to the statements of the third paragraph, the transformation process, which occupied almost the entire period studied and especially accelerated after the 2008 crisis, was a reorientation of party systems towards a new cleavage with the transition of the spectrum to a state where parties are simultaneously oriented towards two axes of demarcation - socio-economic and global-value . According to the findings, during this period there was also a sharp tightening of spatial competition in the center of the spectrum, especially affecting the positions of the social-democrats, who were forced not only to experience a crisis against the backdrop of austerity policies, but also to enter into competition with several families at once - with the traditional right for the median voter, with the populist right for the disillusioned voter, with the radical left for the ideological voter and with the new left-liberal /green pole parties for the progressive middle class voter.

According to the conclusions of the first paragraph, the right-left axis in the context of the growing significance of the new cleavage has tilted, giving rise to a moderate correlation between left-of-center and cultural progressivism (GAL values) on the one hand, right-of-center and cultural protectionism (TAN values) on the other. In the context of the presented research, the first paragraph actually proves its main hypothesis about the key influence of the process of institutionalization of the new post-industrial cleavage on the transformation of the party systems of EU countries in the period from 1990 to 2020.

In the context of the key assumption, which asserted the presence of country and subregional differences in the transformation of party systems in EU countries, the

first paragraph demonstrates that if Western countries were characterized by a transformation of the party spectrum through the entry into it of small niche parties of a new type, focused on new cleavage and competition with well-structured all-inclusive parties of the center, then for post-communist countries the direction of transformation was initially determined by the volatile dynamics of transit and the orientation of the party spectrum towards several non-economic cleavages with the further inclusion of a new cleavage among them, which was accompanied not by the emergence of parties of a new type, but by an adjustment of the positions of large catch-all parties taking into account new problems.

Paragraph 3.2. “Patterns of transformation of party systems of EU countries in the 1990-2020s” is devoted to a description of the scheme for identifying patterns of transformation of party systems of EU countries in the period from 1990 to 2020. The second paragraph contains the rationale for identifying six patterns of transformation, including two variants of the pattern of post-communist countries, given by the one described in the second chapter by structural-genetic differences, and four patterns for the countries of North-Western and Southern Europe, for the division of which Lijphart's classification of political systems was used as the main model .

The second paragraph substantiates the key role of the difference between coalition-consensus and majoritarian-polarized systems as generating structural differences in the trajectories of party transformation: if for systems of coalition multi-party systems the main consequence of the institutionalization of a new cleavage is the growth of sectoral fragmentation, then for a polarized party system - an increase in the risks of it replacing a new one, focused on a modified right-left axis with a greater role for populism in politics.

In the context of the presented research, in the second paragraph, the goal of the dissertation is achieved - describing the patterns of transformation of the party systems of the EU countries in the period from 1990 to 2023, as well as the classification of 25 EU countries according to their belonging to these patterns. In

addition, within the framework of the second paragraph, a list of factors influencing the transformation trajectory is substantiated, the framework of which, in addition to the type of political system, includes the initial structure of cleavages, the level of socio-economic development, the type of electoral system, the state of the welfare state and a number of other parameters.

Finally, the second paragraph also provides an original vision of the phenomenon of dominant parties in Central-Eastern Europe - as a type of subregional pattern, within which one large party manages to seize leadership in representing several related cleavages against the backdrop of continued fragmentation in the positioning of its competitors.

In conclusion, the main conclusions of the study are formulated. In particular, the main conclusion of the study is the following: the party systems of the EU countries in the 1990-2020s experienced a process of fundamental transformation in the context of the institutionalization of a new global-value demarcation. Additionally, the conclusion substantiates the interpretation according to which the rise of new party families, oriented towards a global-value cleavage, is accompanied not by the widespread replacement of old parties with new ones, but by the tightening of spatial competition, within which there is an increase in the representation of post-industrial themes in the agendas of all party families without exception, and the alignment of the party spectrum around a modified right-left axis. The conclusion ends with a description of six patterns of transformation of EU countries in the period 1990-2020, as well as the theoretical basis for their identification.

The findings obtained are evidence of the provisions submitted for defense. These provisions taken together confirm the hypothesis according to which the transformation of the party systems of the EU countries in the period from 1990 to 2020 was of a radical and systemic nature associated with the institutionalization of a new global-value cleavage, and also that this process is complex in nature, not being reduced to the replacement of old ones parties are new, and that this situation

gives rise to a number of subregional and country differences associated with the influence of a number of external systemic factors, primarily the type of political system.

III . List of publications on the topic of the dissertation

The results of this study were tested during the author's reports at the following conferences and scientific seminars:

1. All-Russian conference of RAPN "Political science in a changing world: new practices and theoretical search", report "Patterns of transformation of party systems of EU countries based on data from 1990-2023" within the framework of the meeting of the Research Committee for the comparative study of party and electoral systems (Moscow, 2023 G.).
2. XXIV Yasin (April) international scientific conference on problems of economic and social development, report "Patterns of transformation of the political spectrum of European party systems in the 21st century" in the framework of the section "Political processes" (Moscow, 2023).
3. XXIII Yasin (April) international scientific conference on problems of economic and social development, report "European Populism : from niche status to catch-all ambitions " as part of the round table " Populist Mobilization , Globalization and Locality in East and West " (Moscow, 2022).
4. International round table "The Challenge of Populism: Impact on Traditional Left-wing and Right-wing parties in Europe", report "Electoral resources of right-wing populism in the context of party competition" (Moscow, 2022) .

The main results on the topic of the dissertation are presented in four publications:

1. Petrov I.I. Not only the far right: which parties occupy the niche of cultural protectionism in the European Union? Bulletin of the Russian Peoples' Friendship University. Series: Political science. 2021. Vol. 23. No. 4. P. 692-705.

2. Petrov I.I. Electoral sources of the growth of populism in Europe. *Modern Europe*. 2022. No. 6. P. 207-218.
3. Makarenko B.I. Petrov I.I. Dynamics of the political spectrum of European party systems (1990-2021). *Polis. Political studies*. 2023. No. 1. P. 11-28.
4. Petrov I.I. Patterns of transformation of party systems in EU countries: direction of change and reasons for differences. *Politia* . 2024. No. 2. P. 119-137.